

**We'll begin shortly.
While you wait...**

**Be sure to dial in by phone;
512-623-5114 code 52533#**

We won't be using VoIP (Voiceover IP) for this session. The phone lines will be opened during the presentation to accommodate your questions.

Wednesday, March 16, 2016

***Surviving Interstate Custody:
the Economic, Safety and Legal
Implications for Battered Women***

The Legal Resource Center on Violence Against Women

Presenters:
Deborah Goelman, Esq.
Darren Mitchell, Esq.

Wednesday, March 16, 2016

Praxis International Rural Technical Assistance on Violence Against Women

Webinar tips

- **The audio for today's participation is by phone only. We want to hear from you!**
 - If you are logged in by phone only, email comments while the lines are muted to liz@praxisinternational.org
- **Share your comment using chat:**
 - If you are logged into the webinar platform, "chat" comments or questions to group via **Public Tab** until the phone lines are opened.
 - Use **Private Tab** and select Liz to ask questions or report technical problems
- **The phone lines will be opened during the presentation for questions.**
 - Please mute your phone by pressing *6 when you are not speaking, and be sure not to place your line on hold.
- **If you lose webinar connection:**
 - Use initial join link from email invitation to reconnect or email liz@praxisinternational.org for help
- **If you lose telephone connection:**
 - Dial back in. If you continue to be disconnected and you have a cell phone available, try calling from cell.

Surviving Interstate Custody: the Economic, Safety and Legal Implications for Battered Women

The Legal Resource Center on Violence Against Women

Presenters:

Deborah Goelman, Esq.
Darren Mitchell, Esq.

Wednesday, March 16, 2016

For Praxis International Rural Technical Assistance on Violence
Against Women

What does the LRC do?

- Train attorneys, victim advocates, and judges about the laws and issues affecting survivors in interstate custody and domestic violence cases
- Assist survivors to find attorneys in interstate cases involving a jurisdictional legal issue
- Provide support to attorneys, victim advocates, and others in individual interstate cases
- Maintain a website with jurisdictional and related laws (www.lrcvaw.org)
- Maintain a database of attorneys and programs available to assist survivors in interstate cases
- Offer resources to attorneys, including a law school research and writing curriculum on interstate custody and domestic violence

5

When is it appropriate to refer a case to the LRC?

- The case involves domestic violence
- There is a child custody issue
- The case involves more than one state

6

When is it appropriate to refer a case to the LRC?

- Please note that we do not handle international cases; these involve different laws and issues
- We do not directly represent survivors, but we assist survivors to find civil attorneys when a jurisdictional legal issue is involved
- Some of these cases involve criminal charges against a survivor; in such cases, she may need a criminal defense attorney as well as a civil attorney

7

How can survivors find a civil attorney?

Contact the LRC regarding interstate cases

In other cases:

- Find out if local programs receive VAWA funds to represent survivors
- Check the local legal services programs and law school clinical programs
- Call local law firms and ask about pro bono representation
- Consult state domestic violence coalitions and local domestic violence shelters/programs for referrals to private attorneys
- Check with local bar association, women's bar association and volunteer attorney programs for referrals⁸

8

Who are we and when are we available?

- We have 2 part-time attorneys on staff and one project coordinator
- We are open during business hours E.S.T.

9

Highlights of the UCCJEA

What provisions may be used to assist survivors?

10

The Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction and Enforcement Act (UCCJEA)

Does a state have the power to enter a custody order over a child?

11

UCCJEA:

- Developed in 1997
- Designed to replace the Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction Act (UCCJA)
- Intended to reconcile differences between the UCCJA and PKPA
- So far all states and D.C. have enacted it except for Massachusetts
- Significant improvement for battered women

12

UCCJEA Adoption

Alabama	Louisiana	Ohio
Alaska	Maine	Oklahoma
Arizona	Maryland	Oregon
Arkansas	Michigan	Pennsylvania
California	Minnesota	Rhode Island
Colorado	Mississippi	South Carolina
Connecticut	Missouri	South Dakota
Delaware	Montana	Tennessee
District of Columbia	Nebraska	Texas
Florida	Nevada	U.S. Virgin Islands
Georgia	New Hampshire	Utah
Hawaii	New Jersey	Vermont
Idaho	New Mexico	Virginia
Illinois	New York	Washington
Indiana	North Carolina	West Virginia
Iowa	North Dakota	Wisconsin
Kansas		Wyoming
Kentucky		

13

When may a court hear a custody case?

UCCJEA

Jurisdictional bases:

- Home state trumps other bases (except emergency)
- Significant connection
- "More appropriate forum" jurisdiction
- "No other state" jurisdiction

*Note that the UCCJEA applies after a child is born

14

Emergency jurisdiction . . .

15

UCCJEA:

Temporary emergency jurisdiction:

- Where “necessary in an emergency to protect the child because the child, or a sibling or parent of the child, is subjected to or threatened with mistreatment or abuse.”
- Child must be present in the state
This means that a court can exercise emergency jurisdiction in domestic violence cases where the mother (but not the child) has been abused

16

UCCJEA:

Filing for temporary emergency jurisdiction:

- State procedures vary; UCCJEA does not specify procedure and forms
- May be able to file for temporary emergency order under protection order statute
- Submit evidence establishing the emergency: evidence of abuse of parent and/or child

17

Inconvenient forum . . .

(under the UCCJEA, a party can ask a court to transfer a custody case elsewhere)

18

UCCJEA:

Inconvenient Forum:

Factors explicitly include:

- Whether domestic violence has occurred and is likely to continue and which state could best protect the parties and the child
- The length of time the child has resided outside of the state
- The distance between the two courts
- The relative finances of the parties

19

UCCJEA:

Inconvenient Forum:

Factors explicitly include:

- The agreement of the parties
- The nature and location of the evidence including the child's testimony
- The ability of each court to decide the issue expeditiously and the procedures necessary to present the evidence
- The familiarity of each court with the facts and issues in the pending litigation

20

Case Scenario

Lila Smith calls you. You learn in the brief conversation that Lila and Philip have been married for five years and have lived in a rural part of Maryland. They have one child, a seven-month old daughter named Annie. Philip has physically and emotionally abused Lila since shortly after they were married. Philip has never been charged or convicted criminally for the abuse, and Lila has never filed for a civil protection order.

21

Case Scenario continued

Last night, Philip held a gun to Lila's head in front of Annie and threatened to kill her.

Lila tells you that she wants to leave and move to Wisconsin, where her family lives and where she hopes to find a job.

22

Relocation Checklist

What legal issues does Lila need to consider?

23

Legal Issues in Relocation

- Has a custody order been entered previously, including as part of a protection order?
- Can she leave without violating the order?
- Will she be charged with contempt or parental kidnapping (criminal)?
 - Domestic violence exemption?
 - Domestic violence defense?
 - Child protection defense?
- Will the state from which she is fleeing have continuing exclusive jurisdiction?
- Can she leave without violating the state relocation law?

24

Legal Issues in Relocation

- Should she file for a protection order before she leaves the state?
- Will she be able to file for a protection order in the new state (personal jurisdiction)?
- Should she file for custody before she leaves the state?
- Will she be required to return to a state to litigate a custody case?
- How do the custody laws differ in the two states?
- Are there other legal protections that could keep her safer in one state versus the other?
- Are there immigration-related consequences to leaving the state?
- Will it be more difficult to seek child support or a divorce if she leaves?

25

Practical tips

WHEN SURVIVORS LEAVE:

- It is important to find out whether a case has been filed in the jurisdiction they have left.
- A left-behind parent may be permitted by a judge to move forward in a custody case even if the other parent does not receive actual notice of the proceeding.
- It is critical to participate in court proceedings in the home state, either in person or by telephone.

26

Practical tips

WHEN BATTERERS ABDUCT A CHILD:

Survivors may need to seek enforcement of custody orders in the state in which the child has been abducted. In most cases, they will need a "pick up order" from a judge in that state, even if they already have a valid custody order from another state.

27

Should Lila get a protection order before she moves?

The decision is very complex and legal advice should be sought.

Benefits of obtaining a protection order:

- If it is issued, this will document the violence, which could be helpful for jurisdictional and custody arguments in the future
- It may help protect the survivor and would be enforceable nationally
- If the survivor is awarded custody as part of the protection order, the abuser would not be able to take the children away from her
- The survivor may not be able to get a protection order from a court in another state later if that court does not have personal jurisdiction over the abuser

28

Risks of obtaining a protection order:

- If the protection order is not issued, the abuser will claim that he never abused the survivor (in future legal proceedings)
- If the abuser is awarded some sort of regular visitation, the survivor will have to comply which may make it impossible to leave the state
- If a custody order is issued as part of the protection order, this may give the issuing state continuing, exclusive jurisdiction, forcing the survivor to litigate further custody proceedings in the issuing state

29

Risks of obtaining a protection order (cont'd):

- If a custody order is issued as part of the protection order, this may trigger the state's parental kidnapping or relocation laws if the survivor leaves
- If the survivor seeks a protection order in your state, it may make it more difficult to win an "inconvenient forum" argument later (if she asks your state to transfer the long-term custody case to another state)

30

Parental Kidnapping

In some states, leaving the state with your children could violate state parental kidnapping laws . . .

These criminal laws may have different names:

- Parental kidnapping
- Custodial interference
- Child abduction
- Child concealment

31

Parental Kidnapping

Advocates need to be familiar with these criminal laws because advising a survivor that she can leave the state with her children could subject her to criminal charges . . .

32

State parental kidnapping laws

Must there be a court order for kidnapping to occur?

- Some states require flight with children in violation of a court order
- Some criminalize flight even in the absence of a court order
- Some state laws are unclear
- Some expressly criminalize fleeing in both contexts, but create more serious penalties for violating a court order

33

State parental kidnapping laws

What type of intent is required by these laws?

They vary by state.

- Usually, the parent must intend to do something more than just leave the state with the child
- Often require things such as "intent to conceal the child from the other parent" or "intent to deprive the other parent of visitation"

34

State parental kidnapping laws

Are there any protections for domestic violence survivors?

They vary by state.

- Some states have exemptions, others have defenses

35

State parental kidnapping laws

Exemptions:

- In a few states, language in the parental kidnapping statute exempts victims from prosecution
- Usually must satisfy a condition for it to apply: e.g., the person must report to law enforcement or to a prosecutor that she has left the state with the children and why, and she must file for custody within a specified amount of time
- These types of conditions pose problems for many survivors

36

State parental kidnapping laws

Defenses:

- Unlike exemptions, defenses generally require at least the initial involvement of the criminal justice system
- Victims may be arrested and jailed initially and permitted to raise a defense later

37

State parental kidnapping laws

Types of Defenses:

- Fleeing domestic violence
- Fleeing harm to self
- Fleeing harm to child

General criminal law defense:

- Necessity

38

State parental kidnapping laws

Consequences:

Even if a survivor is acquitted of the criminal charges, often the children are returned to the batterer while a victim is incarcerated or awaiting trial.

Additionally, she may lose her children in a subsequent custody case if a civil court judge perceives her flight as an attempt to deprive the perpetrator of contact with the children or as an attempt to forum-shop.

39

National Organizations

- **Legal Resource Center on Violence Against Women**
(301) 270-1550, lrc@lrcvaw.org, www.lrcvaw.org
- **National Center on Protection Orders and Full Faith and Credit** (800) 903-0111, ext. 2
- **National Clearinghouse for the Defense of Battered Women**, (800) 903-0111, ext. 3

40

This presentation was supported by Grant No. 2009-TA-AX-K021 awarded by the Office on Violence Against Women, U.S. Department of Justice. The opinions, findings, conclusions, and recommendations expressed in this presentation are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Department of Justice, Office on Violence Against Women.

41
